

# REVIEW: 2012 TAGS Day for Music Postgraduates

Department of Music, University of Southampton, Saturday 21<sup>st</sup> April, 2012

**Contributors: Rebecca Thumpston, Patrick Hinds, Joseph Knowles, Tom Sayer, Jun Zubillaga-Pow, Anupam Roy, Yi Eun Chung**

**Editor: Shay Loya**

This year's TAGS was every bit as international and interesting as the last one I have attended as committee member. Immediately after the first session it was evident that this conference would also be memorably sociable – was it the excellent buffet (all hail Kirstie Hewlett, our recently elected student rep!), a real focal point in the conference, that did the trick? Some of this ambiance was captured in a few photographs that I have posted on <http://www.sma.ac.uk/2012/07/tags-2012-picture-gallery/>. As for the academic business, the sheer versatility of repertoire and issues was an almost embarrassment of riches in a one-day conference numbering 20 papers. It is a testament to Kenneth Smith's organisational skills that he managed to piece these papers together into a well-structured programme with well-differentiated parallel sessions, which made the choice between them less problematic for most people. On the downside, some sessions were poorly attended, especially as the day wore on, which was certainly not due to their quality but rather down to the current popularity of some research areas as opposed to others. But our intrepid scholars laugh in the face of such worldly concerns. If Schenker's life is anything to go by, a somewhat empty room will not dishearten anyone who knows his or her work's true worth. After all, marginalized by the academic establishment of his time, Schenker eventually received the honour of occupying the final and only single session in TAGS 2012! And that, one should add, was another fair programming choice by Kenneth, given the scale of the Schenker Project, the fact that its members were our gracious hosts, and that this session progressed organically into Bill Drabkin's keynote address. The only thing missing from this conference was the presence of Kenneth himself: frustratingly, he could not enjoy the fruits of his labour, nor the appetizing conference buffet, as he was quite sick on the day (don't worry, he's fine now!). This is the place to thank him, the other committee members, and especially David Bretherton and his group of postgrad volunteers – Helen MacFarlane, Alex Glyde-Bates, and Austin Glatthorn – who all did a sterling job.

We tried something a bit different for the reviews this year. No less than seven reviewers divided the job between them in order to make sure every session was covered. With little editorial interference from me, this complete but individuated coverage resulted, inevitably, in something of a pot-pourri, a progression of short vignettes and a mixture of styles. All feedbacks are welcome, and I apologize in advance to those who prefer their reviews more teleological and Ursatzed. In any case, I hope you enjoy the variety and at least get a good idea of what the conference was about. See you next year!

***Shay Loya***

## Session 1a: Analysing Early Music

**Suzie Wilkins** (University of Sussex): Performing the Simulacrum: The Performances and Re-Compositions of the Early Music Ensemble 'Red Priest'  
**Joseph Knowles** (University of York): Gesualdo's madrigal *Mercè grido piangendo* – A Set-Theory Analysis

TAGS 2012 opened with two fascinating papers addressing modern approaches to early music. Suzie Wilkins's paper focused on Red Priest's re-compositional practices from 2003–10. Wilkins explained that Red Priest occupy different subject positions in performance, foregrounding subjectivity as an important part of their audiences' experience. She examined different ways in which the ensemble alters their performing style to enhance aesthetic experience, for instance by foregrounding moments of musical narrative (such as the use of Bartók pizzicato to enhance the 'hunt' in Vivaldi's *Autumn*), and via the narrativisation of absolute music (for example the assignation of agency to instruments). While Wilkins did not draw extensively on the music narratology literature, her paper had resonances with a number of key debates in this field about the play of meanings between listener, performer, and composer during explorations of musical agency. Wilkins argued that Red Priest's adoption of performance personae demonstrates their attempt to address the necessary mediation of an historical text. Unlike the so-called 'historically-informed' movement, Red Priest's solution to questions of 'authenticity' is to use the aforementioned narrative effects in combination with the foregrounding of performance subjectivity to create a new 'text' for a 21<sup>st</sup> century audience. Contemporary, anachronistic musical quotations are used to make the new text more convincing; Wilkins highlighted a Fawcett Towers quotation, much to the audience's delight.

Like Red Priest's re-composition of early music, Joseph Knowles's paper sought to use modern knowledge to illuminate early music – in this case Gesualdo's depiction of the complaint of a lover. After examining the limitations of traditional modal analysis, Knowles explored the harmonic structures in Gesualdo's madrigal, with particular focus on chromatic passages. Set theory, he argued, can be used to show a complex compositional process at work behind the chromaticism, unavailable through more traditional analytical means. Knowles traced his analysis carefully through the madrigal, with precisely selected musical examples (both visual and audio) that helped the audience follow his sophisticated reading of a complex underlying compositional process driven by intervallic structure, revealing a new facet of Gesualdo's mastery.

**Rebecca Thumpston**

## Session 1b: Analysing Electro-Acoustic Music

**Pedro Macedo Mendonça** (University of Aveiro, Portugal): Music, Politics, and musical analysis: A possible combination in the acousmatic composition *Concréletra* by Marcelo Carneiro

**Maria Davelou** (Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece): Auditory Stream Segregation and Grouping Structure: Perceptual Organization of the Minimal Works *Piano Phase* by Steve Reich and *Phrygian Gates* by John Adams.

Pedro Macedo Mendonça drew on a range of analytical methodologies to give a fascinating reading of "Concréletra" by Marcelo Carneiro, a piece that juxtaposes

Che Guevara speeches with an atonal musical background. Drawing on James Gibson's *ecological theory*, Pedro gave a detailed analysis of 'acousmatic' atonal music. It is to Mendonça's credit that his reading managed to make sense of music that purports to focus our attention on pure sound irrespective of which acoustic or electronic agent produces it (hence 'acousmatic'), using core ecological theory principles such as the specification of virtual space and the relationship between perceiver and environment. Such unconventional analytical methods were not confined to formal analysis. Indeed, they led to the conclusion that Che Guevara's speech, typically interpreted as a discourse on oppression, becomes expressive of freedom in Marcelo Carneiro's musical context. This paper deftly illustrated music's ability to promote different perspectives on lingual meaning, although perhaps if Pedro had more time he may have given a little more detail about how the respective analytical models cited cohere on a theoretical level.

Maria Davelou's insightful and highly methodical paper looked at two challenging minimalist pieces. She invoked a litany of analytical concepts from formal to psychological, dissecting the chosen works with tools such as voice separation, Gestalt principles, auditory grouping and even neurological research. With the use of instructive visual aids the speaker approached the various musical elements, explicating auditory streams, voice separation and rhythmic themes and groups. The various theoretical models were employed to illuminate listener phenomenology, such as the sense of closure, which does not come about through conventional means in these pieces: Davelou gave a neuroscientific account of closure as related to intensity of brain activity. Her exploration of polyrhythms through the asymmetry of rhythmic auditory streams and of the palindromic nature of some of the rhythmic themes were two other notable points of interest. The analysis was certainly rigorous and detailed, though its focus on music's strictly formal and subconsciously perceived aspects left some stones unturned – issues pertaining to narrative, content, context, and so on – which is all good news for future research.

**Patrick Hinds**

## **Session 2a: Other Beethovens**

**Anupam Roy** (Goldsmiths, University of London): The (an)other hero: Different strains of the 'heroic' in the music of Beethoven's Middle Period

**Jun Zubillaga-Pow** (King's College, London): Agawu, Clarke and Spitzer: Towards a Psychoanalytic Perception of Beethoven's Op. 132

Although this session concentrated only on the music of Beethoven, it became quickly apparent that there would be a lot of variety within the hour. Anupam Roy made vibrant use of PowerPoint to confidently deliver a paper on the contrasting strains of heroism in Beethoven's middle period. Moving away from the conventional hero of the fifth symphony, Roy explored more subtle types of hero in a large selection of music from Beethoven's middle period: the hero as the overcomer of suffering (an allusion to Beethoven's own hearing loss), or he who Orpheus-like keeps two strongly opposing forces at bay, taming the wild beats in the second movement of the Fourth Piano Concerto. Concentrating not only on musical sources, Roy also drew on heroic literary references from Shelly, Coleridge and Wordsworth to demonstrate how, for example in the lyrical passages of his Violin Concerto, Beethoven creates a solo persona that, like a Shelleyan Skylark, builds bonds of sympathy with his peers.

After a productive discussion, Jun Zubillaga-Pow provided a complete contrast to the vast collection of works discussed by Roy by focusing only on a few bars from Beethoven's late period in his paper. He set himself the impressive task of describing the different methodologies of discursive analyses devised and practiced in the twentieth century and their utilization within the post-structural application of psychoanalysis. In order to combine the topical, ecological and metaphorical works of Agawu, Clarke and Spitzer, Zubillaga-Pow devised a psychological act he calls 'imaginary and symbolic' listening. Without the aid of PowerPoint, he eloquently revisited and reassessed how the Lacanian discourse on classical music has been understood, leading to his close reading of a few bars through which he examined contrasting methodologies. He finally returned to Agawu, Clarke and Spitzer to confirm his thesis of 'imaginary and symbolic listening' based on Lacan's theories of the unconscious. Both papers were well received and the lively discussion that followed could only be stopped by lunch.

**Joseph Knowles**

## **Session 2b: Russian Music of the Twentieth Century**

**Chien-Jung, Li** (Graduate Institute of Musicology, National Taiwan University): Progression in the First Tableau of Stravinsky's *Petrushka*

**Olga Sologub** (University of Manchester): Large-scale structure in Sergei Prokofiev's Piano Sonata No. 8 in B-flat.

The two abstracts of this session promised thoughtful and well-researched papers: they did not disappoint. Li Chien-Jung presented a scientific methodology that was more than matched by her precise delivery. The point of the paper was to tackle two opposing analytical approaches to *Petrushka* (and Stravinsky works of the same period in general), one emphasizing fragmentation the other coherence and continuity. Chien-Jung reinforced the latter approach from a fresh angle: instead of focusing on pitch structures, she divided the music into what she called 'cellular groupings', a hierarchical order arranged according to parameters of rhythm and metre. The examples given in the presentation were very detailed and articulated her theory very well, however, the data was at times overwhelming and one can only look forward to the published version when all of this detail can be digested at leisure.

Olga Sologub's paper on large-scale structures in Prokofiev's music was itself well structured, with the intended outcomes of the research clear from the start. After briefly introducing the three movements of the Sonata no. 8 and the context of its composition, Olga used her hand-out to work through the keys implied (if not realized) throughout the three movements. Her basically neo-Riemannian reading of the background challenged a simplistic application of classical forms and formal processes to Prokofiev's music. What I have found personally interesting here is that the results of this analysis could be potentially applied beyond musicology and music theory to composition too – obviously not by using the same chords and key signatures but by thinking about the application of such structures outside the traditions of sonata or rondo forms. Olga's broader knowledge of her PhD research was also evident in the expert replies she gave during the discussion.

**Tom Sayer**

### **Session 3a: Analysis of Time & Rhythm**

**Yi Eun Chung** (University of Cambridge): Re-Reading Schubert's Goethe: Multi-layered Time and Cross-Referentiality in Schubert's Op. 3

**Will Bosworth** (University of Birmingham): Metrical Dissonance in the First Movement of Brahms's Piano Trio in C Major, Op. 87: Conflicts and Non-Maximal Resolutions

Opening a session that ostensibly concentrated on the temporal and rhythmic musical parameters, Yi Eun Chung's paper was actually about how four Lieder – all set to poems by Goethe but composed at different times – formed a coherent textual (poetic) and musical narrative throughout what Schubert decided to publish as his Op. 3. He substantiates this thesis with both historical and semiotic analyses, and also provided proof that it was Schubert himself who ordered the songs – an uncommon example of authorial control in an age of Lieder commodification. Chung further suggested that Schubert's music re-reads the content of the poems with metaphorical schematics and harmonic grammar that reinterprets and even oversteps Goethe's original meaning, and it is through this that the previous absence of musical unity was transformed into a coherent song cycle. Given the historical lack of any precedence, not even by Beethoven, Schubert's compositional and artistic vision appears to be particularly bold and historically significant.

Will Bosworth analysed the rhythmic intricacies of Brahms's music with the concept of 'metrical dissonance' and illustrated his theory impressively with the first movement of Brahms's Second Piano Trio. He first laid out the various taxonomies of rhythmic organisation, metrical accents and stratifications, such as the pulse layer, the micropulses and the interpretative layers, which move at various speeds and organizational logic. Next, he provided numerous instances of metrical consonances and dissonances in the music of Mozart and Brahms respectively. These include: displacement dissonance, which uses additive integers; grouping dissonance, exemplified by the hemiola; and compound dissonance, which is a combination of the former two and which Bosworth hears as a rare but powerful musical rhetoric. Correspondingly, Bosworth applied his systematic theory to the analysis of metrical dissonances with five statements of the main theme in the opening movement of Brahms's Piano Trio Op. 87. Post-presentation Q&A brought out the complications in applying a loaded pitch-related term to metre. Listening to the paper I thought that perhaps neologisms such as homometrics, heterometrics and polymetrics may be of some further use. Just a thought.

***Jun Zubillaga-Pow***

## Session 3b: Analysis of Music and the Moving Image

**Vivien Leanne Saunders** (University of Lancaster): Analysing Multimedia Dissonance in Film

**Tom Charles Sayer** (University of Bangor): Following its Inception: The symbiosis of film and music in *Memento*

Focusing on the interaction between image, music and sound effects, Vivien Leanne Saunders's theoretical model gave a penetrating insight into the role of music in avant-garde film. Although the interpretation of any film and its music, Saunders argued, is essentially subjective, models from numerous authors such as Cook, Tagg and LaRue converge in important ways that suggest an objective or at least consensual modes of perception. Saunders emphasized the frequent contradictory relation between music and image, furnishing us with the concepts 'Conformance' and 'Contestation', which refer respectfully to the music's potential to be either coherent or at odds with the film. Drawing on these, and providing a fair degree of reasoned critique, Saunders constructed her own model. This is clearly an ambitious and effective model, although the short time limit prevented more detailed discussion of how the model can be applied to particular case studies.

As film has evolved, new production techniques have produced new challenges to analysts, beyond the scope of conventional models. Tom Charles Sayer's paper postulated that existing theoretical models are somewhat outdated and definitely imprecise, incapable of achieving the degree of detail necessary for an effective response to new developments in contemporary film. Through a study of the film *Memento*, Sayer pointed out the often implicit nature of music's meaning, and its function as a temporal 'anchor' that acts both with and against the film's narrative. A close analysis shed light on particular musical effects such as a conservative use of melody helping portray a sense of loss, and capacity of musical themes to refer to previous narrative concepts. The ambition and effectiveness of the offered model was impressive, although Sayer's account never departed from the conceptual content of the narrative. It will be interesting to see whether Sayer's PhD thesis will also include the purely aesthetic quality of music and image in film.

**Patrick Hinds**

## Session 4a: Analysis, Ontologies & Agency

**Jonathan Lewis** (Royal Holloway): Beyond Essence, The Given and Determinacy ... In Fact, Beyond the Philosophy of Music!

**Patrick Hinds** (University of Surrey): On Music's Nonconceptual Ontology: Beyond Objects

**Rebecca Thumpston** (University of Keele): Bodies at Play: Agency in Elgar's Cello Concerto

Jonathan Lewis presented a critical overview of current music philosophy. He compared and contrasted various musical ontologies from the automania of Aaron Ridley to the purism of David Coopers, alongside formalist and essentialist schools of thought. Lewis swiftly moved on to the role of the philosopher, who relies on a system of precepts and propositions to clarify the meaning of music. He particularly criticized a reductive approach to music that was intellectually subordinate to linguistic models of meaning (music is not only a language), and proposed a general philosophical approach that is at once more metaphysical and more practically

grounded as an 'unfinished event' (borrowing Gadamer's concept) within cultural, historical and social contexts. The discussion that ensued came back to the point of intellectual and disciplinary hierarchies: why must a philosophical approach to music flatten its most musical aspects, and how can a music-specific perspective inform philosophy or, indeed, other disciplines in the humanities? Lewis's paper seemed to be at the starting point of giving that last question serious consideration.

Patrick Hinds seemed to assault the very idea of musical representation, which has traditionally allowed an interdisciplinary exploration of music, as well as musical styles that aesthetically declared themselves as representational (programme music, national music and so on). He offered to study music as a non-conceptual phenomenon or 'qualia' that eludes objectification, and basically offered a modern reading of music that, against current fashions, is related to Hanslick's 'absolute music', yet goes through more current thinking about consciousness and experience. The stunned silence that followed this talk was possibly the result of the audience still digesting ideas that were new and concepts that were by no means familiar to all. A discussion followed eventually, but did not pick up on the main points of the speaker. It is generally a problem in conferences that when presenting a difficult subject one must always decide between rigour and accessibility. Here a bit more accessibility would not have been amiss.

Rebecca Thumpston's paper examined musical agency in performance through a single rising scale at b. 32 in Elgar's famous cello concerto. She situated musical agency within the discourse of music narratology, and her interpretation of the concerto involved specifically the idea of 'intra-agency' – a fluid location of musical agency between work, performer and listener – as an important means to narrative interpretation. Examining the contour of an ascending scale and its temporal execution, we all got a sense that something quite intricate was happening in the tense reaction between soloist/orchestra and performers/audiences. The personifying, mimetic aspect of this scale was further highlighted by Thumpston's reference to Arnie Cox's mimetic hypothesis that describes 'how music becomes internalized into the bodies and minds of listeners' (MTO 17/2, 2011). By transferring Cone's idea of 'expressive potential' onto the performer's action, Thumpston further showed how musical intra-agency lies in between the work and the subjective consciousness of the performer or listener. The paper was followed by an interesting response from William Drabkin, who argued that, in relation to the theme that has come before it, the scale stretches far beyond its likely endpoint, as if a standard exercise in string playing were suddenly thrust into a symphonic score, changing the focus from 'the music' to 'the musician'. In other words, we can already find the origins of a performance tradition and audience experience in the score, i.e. in a deliberate, and perhaps exaggerated and unique compositional gesture. Nevertheless, Thumpston undoubtedly has other fine examples to demonstrate intra-agency: and let us stress, this one did a good job at illustrating her meaning.

***Jun Zubillaga-Pow and Shay Loya***

## Session 4b: Cycles & Fragments

**Andrew Earnshaw** (University of Liverpool): The Kick Inside: 'Groundless' Cycles and Unattained Aspirations in Kate Bush's *Wuthering Heights*

**Lucy Craddock** (The Open University): Rubbra's Homage to Teilhard de Chardin

**Martin Scheuregger** (University of York): Destination, path, hesitation: issues of scale, structure and unity in György Kurtág's *Kafka Fragments*

This session started with Andrew Earnshaw providing a fresh insight into Kate Bush's 1978 song 'Wuthering Heights'. In his paper 'The Kick Inside: 'Groundless Cycles and Unattained Aspirations in Kate Bush's *Wuthering Heights*', Earnshaw drew on the duality of the keys in response to Nicky Losseff's article on the song (*Popular Music* 18, 1999: 227-40). He argued that the seemingly perpetual putting off of Cathy's homecoming is mirrored aptly by the tonic key failing to inject the sense of security expected of it. The stability envisaged is never found, as the hexatonic consonant becomes the least consonant of all chords, providing a sense of groundlessness that thwarts Cathy's desire to finally find home. Her longings are teased by the harmony, offering only glimpses of what the fulfillment that she longed for could be like. Cathy's journey is reflected through changes in tonality, but the D flat (the putative 'home' key) is never achieved convincingly – evidently, the goal is not just to reach home, but to inhabit or possess it fully.

Next Lucy Craddock presented 'Rubbra's Homage to Teilhard de Chardin'. Craddock's PhD research focuses on spirituality in the music of Edmund Rubbra, and this paper drew attention to some of the ways in which the composer upholds in his Eighth Symphony the ideas behind the writings of French Jesuit geologist and palæontologist Teilhard de Chardin and his threefold concept of the universe: cosmogenesis (the universe as continual and dynamic), noogenesis (consciousness and reflection), and Christogenesis (convergence towards an Omega that Teilhard identifies with Christ). Rubbra's enthusiasm for the above – which Ursula King refers to as 'a synthesis of circle and straight line' – is reflected in his subtle 'convergence' of intervals and keys across the movements of the Symphony. The principal interval, that of the fourth, between the E flat and the A flat is thus compressed to the third between E natural and G; and subsequently, this third (G to B) is constricted further into a second (A flat to B flat). It creates a feeling of lopsided symmetry, a spiral convergence towards the Omega.

The final paper of the session, given by Martin Scheuregger, demonstrated how the forty (!) disparate movements that make up György Kurtág's hour-long *Kafka Fragments*, scored for only violin and soprano, cohere as 'a single, flowing work'. Each movement provides a bigger picture yet of the piece, recontextualizing what has come before, thereby driving towards the notion of the whole – Kurtág's 'pure' and 'closed circle'. The individual fragments may range in duration from a few seconds to seven minutes, but nevertheless they reveal a sense of structural unity, as the longer movements are placed at key junctures, providing the pillars of stability for the otherwise apparently idiosyncratic fragmentary form. Although fragmentation lies at the core of the entire structure, the idea of unity seems to grow as the music progresses and as the violin, especially in its use of open strings, provides a sense of chromatically inflected consonance, the dissonance only arising almost as a by-product. The end result is thus an illuminating and instructive series of partial revelations, each providing an essential window towards the ultimate portrayal of the whole.

**Anupam Roy**

## Session 5: Schenker Documents Panel

**Kirstie Hewlett** (University of Southampton): Music Analysis as a Political Act: Heinrich Schenker and the Expression of Austro-German National Identity

**Georg Burgstaller** (University of Southampton): 'A corner-shop for democratic phrases': political subtexts in Heinrich Schenker's polemics against Paul Bekker, 1913-1922

After a day of parallel sessions, all attendees were brought together in the "Schenker Documents Panel". The discussion in this session on "historical" Schenker was naturally continued in the subsequent keynote address by Prof. William Drabkin. Here the delegates were invited to learn about the professional and personal world of Heinrich Schenker, a seminal figure whose theories came to dominate Anglophone music analysis a few decades after his death. Thanks to research on ideological and socio-historical aspects of Schenker's thought, as well as the output of the *Schenker Documents Online Project*, we are now able to see the demystified Schenker, placing him in the Viennese cultural milieu of the early twentieth century. Two papers presented in this session constituted such attempts to historicize Schenker as a cultural figure, who still has a tremendous influence on analytical thought.

The first paper of the session by Kirstie Hewlett made an excellent introduction to the most provocative elements of Schenker's writings. The process of 'Americanisation of Schenker's theory', in which Schenker's nationalistic comments were completely omitted in the English translations of his writings after the Second World War, questions our own perceptions about him in the past decades and reminded us to historicize him. From such sanitized and erased history, the presenter attempted to grasp the background to Schenker's value judgements through the exploration of his private documents. Schenker's discriminatory view on nationality of performer and folk music drew special attention and debate from the floor.

Subsequently, Georg Burgstaller's paper on Schenker's polemics against Paul Bekker explored unpublished sources from the archive in order to explain his relationship with Paul Bekker, an important critic of the early twentieth century, who like Schenker was of Jewish descent. The presenter convincingly conveyed the epistemological chasm between these two polemicists. Bekker's sociologically orientated view of musical form as a function of the energetic interaction between the productive artist and society could not help but conflict with Schenker's thought about the 'autonomous aristocracy of genius'. And this fundamental difference between two critics was effectively presented in the careful selection of excerpts that highlighted the root cause of the mutual criticism between Schenker and Bekker. Lastly, Burgstaller raised the possibility that the different courses these two critics had taken as Jewish intellectuals in the charged anti-Semitic atmosphere of their time, may explain Schenker's puzzling anti-Semitic criticisms against Bekker.

**Yi Eun Chung**

**Keynote Address: William Drabkin (University of Southampton): 'Schenker's Army: Defending the Fundamental Line of Mozart's G minor Symphony'**

Professor William Drabkin's keynote followed seamlessly from Kirstie Hewlett and Georg Burgstaller's papers in the Schenker Documents Panel. Drabkin's paper focused on Schenker's response to an article 'Über die Urlinie' [Concerning the Fundamental Line] written by Walter Riezler and published in the monthly journal *Die Musik*. The article in question critiqued Schenker's lengthy essay on Mozart's Symphony in G minor K. 550, published three years previously in the second volume of *Das Meisterwerk in der Musik* (1927).

Drabkin noted that while Schenker did not respond personally to Riezler's attack on his methods, he encouraged a number of his pupils to do so, the article having 'touched a wrong nerve'. Riezler's article accused Schenker of losing artistic connection with the foreground. Almost immediately, pupils such as Robert Brünauer and Angi Elias came to his defence. Brünauer argued that Riezler was not sufficiently skilled as a musician to perceive the *Urlinie*, while Elias's response (preserved in the New York public library) commented on Riezler's 'unfortunate temerity to doubt the worth of Schenker's discovery of the *Urlinie*'. Elias responded, in Drabkin's words, in a tone that was 'firm but free from scorn'.

Drabkin's talk shed light on responses to Schenker's theories in his own time. For instance, Drabkin gave the example of Moriz Violin, an old friend of Schenker who confessed to finding the post-1924 analyses difficult to comprehend. Indeed, Violin's own attempts at middleground graphing can, in Drabkin's words, 'at best be described as naïve'. This leads us to understand that, without Schenker's personal intervention and willingness to interpret and promote his own works at a time when Schenkerians (apart from himself) were truly scarce, more of his theory would be left unread and misunderstood. Drabkin's presentation was enlivened with a 'show and tell' element in which a number of first editions were passed around, bringing the historical element of the presentation to life – a fitting end to a successful conference.

***Rebecca Thumpston***